Garnet effect on Nd-Hf isotope decoupling: Evidence from the Jinfosi batholith, Northern Tibetan Plateau

Hui Huang\textsuperscript{a,b,*}, Yaoling Niu\textsuperscript{a,c,d,**}, Xuanxue Mo\textsuperscript{a}

\textsuperscript{a} School of Earth Science and Mineral Resources, China University of Geosciences, Beijing, 100083, China
\textsuperscript{b} Institute of Oceanology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Qingdao 266071, China
\textsuperscript{c} Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Durham, DH1 3LE, UK
\textsuperscript{d} Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Durham, DH1 3LE, UK

\textsuperscript{*} Correspondence to: H. Huang, School of Earth Science and Mineral Resources, China University of Geosciences, Beijing, 100083, China.
\textsuperscript{**} Correspondence to: Y. Niu, Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Durham DH1 3LE, UK.

\textsuperscript{E-mail addresses:} hui.huang.geo@gmail.com (H. Huang), yaoling.niu@foxmail.com (Y. Niu).

A R T I C L E   I N F O

Article history:
Received 22 September 2016
Accepted 21 December 2016
Available online 31 December 2016

Keywords:
Garnet effect
Nd-Hf isotope decoupling
TGT
The North Qilian Orogenic Belt

A B S T R A C T

The initial Nd and Hf isotope ratios of a 420 Ma post-collisional dioritic-granitic batholith from the Northern Tibetan plateau define a negative trend above and orthogonal to the \( E_{\text{Nd}}(t) - E_{\text{Hf}}(t) \) terrestrial array. This uncommon trend offers an insight into the origin of the puzzling Nd-Hf isotope decoupling in the crustal rocks. On this trend, samples depleted in heavy rare earth elements (HREEs, i.e., \([\text{Dy}/\text{Yb}]_N \gtrsim 1\)) deviate most from the terrestrial array whereas samples with flat HREEs (i.e., \([\text{Dy}/\text{Yb}]_N \lesssim 1\)) deviate less or plot within the terrestrial array, pointing to the controlling effect of garnet in the magma source. Ancient garnet-bearing residues after melt extraction will have elevated Lu/Hf ratios and can evolve with time to produce high \( E_{\text{Hf}}(t) \) at a low \( E_{\text{Nd}}(t) \) value. Mixing of melts derived from such source lithologies (high Lu/Hf) with melts possessing a within-terrestrial array Nd-Hf isotopic composition (low Lu/Hf) best explains the observed trend orthogonal to the terrestrial array. The samples from the Jinfosi batholith with the most decoupled Nd-Hf isotope compositions require a larger degree (>40%) and ancient (i.e., \( \gtrsim 1.8 \) Gyr) previous melt extraction from their source. It follows that the ancient melts with depleted HREEs complementary to those garnet-bearing residues should have low \( E_{\text{Hf}} \) values and plot below the terrestrial array, which is indeed shown by some Archean/Paleoproterozoic TTGs.

© 2017 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Extensive isotopic studies of mantle and crustal rocks over the past decades have led to the widespread perception that Lu-Hf and Sm-Nd isotopic systems behave in a similar fashion during magmatic processes, leading to the globally correlated terrestrial array whereas samples with

\[ K_d \text{Lu/Hf} \gg 1 \]

and

\[ K_d \text{Sm/Nd} \gtrsim 1 \]

The dominant mechanism of crustal anatexis usually leaves garnet as a residual phase in the deep crust. The residual garnet has elevated Lu/Hf ratios and can evolve with time to produce high \( E_{\text{Hf}}(t) \) at a low \( E_{\text{Nd}}(t) \) value.

Here, we report our Nd-Hf isotope study of a post-collisional felsic-intermediate sample suite in a 420 Ma Jinfosi batholith from the...
Northern Tibetan Plateau. The negative slope of our data plotted above and orthogonal to the terrestrial array in the $E_{Hf}(t)$-$E_{Nd}(t)$ space offers a novel perspective on Nd-Hf isotopic decoupling as the result of the presence and effect of garnet in granitoid sources of ancient age.

2. Geological background

The North Qilian Orogenic Belt (NQOB), Qilian Block (QB) and North Qaidam ultrahigh pressure metamorphic belt (NQ-UHPM) form the Qilian Orogenic Belt (QOB) on the Northern Tibetan Plateau (Fig. 1, Song et al., 2006). The Mohe gneiss within the NQ-UHPM is the oldest sampled crystalline basement in the QOB, dated at ~2.5 Ga (Li et al., 2007), and the inherited zircons with ages $\geq 2.6$ Ga confirm the existence of an Archean basement in the region (Huang et al., 2015, 2016). Different models have been proposed to explain the tectonic evolution in the whole QOB (Gehrels et al., 2003, 2011; Huang et al., 2015; Song et al., 2006, 2013, 2014; Wu et al., 2006, 2010; Xiao et al., 2009; Xu et al., 1994, 2006; Yang et al., 2002; Yin and Harrison, 2000). The most recent comprehensive studies suggest that the NQOB, QB and NQ-UHPM are different products corresponding to one convergence event, during which the subduction was initiated at ~520 Ma, the ocean basin was closed at 440 Ma, exhumation happened around ~420–400 Ma and final orogen collapsed at ~360 Ma (Song et al., 2006, 2009, 2013, 2014; Wang et al., 2014). In this model, the NQOB is considered to be an oceanic suture zone, the QB represents an imbricate thrust belt, and the NQ-UHPM represents a continental-type subduction zone.

The Jinfosi batholith is one of the largest batholiths in the NQOB, considered as typical products of intra-crustal differentiation in a syn/post-collisional setting (Hu et al., 2006; Song et al., 2013; Wu et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 1995). The NQOB consists of ophiolites, metamorphic rocks and arc magmatic sequences. The magmatic rocks are dominated by calc-alkaline intermediate-felsic volcanic rocks and I-type granitoids with ages of 516 to 446 Ma (Chen et al., 2014; Wang et al., 2005), generally coupled with the subduction-related HP metamorphic activities (489–440 Ma) (Liu et al., 2006; Song et al., 2004, 2006; Wu et al., 1993; Zhang et al., 1997, 2007). The Jinfosi batholith is ~60 km long and 10–12 km wide, extending in NW-direction in the northwestern part of the NQOB (Fig. 1, Song et al., 2013). The batholith intruded the Ordovician back-arc basin volcanic complex and the Silurian sedimentary sequence. It mainly consists of peraluminous granite, biotite monzodiorite and minor diorite (Hu et al., 2006; Song et al., 2013; Wu et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 1995). Major minerals include varying amounts of quartz (Qtz), K-feldspars (Kfs), plagioclase (Pl), biotite (Bt), muscovite, tourmaline and garnet (Grt). Zircon U-Pb dating using the SHRIMP method yields a weighted mean U-Pb age of 424 ± 3 Ma (Wu et al., 2010).

3. Methods

Samples were carefully cleaned for analysis of major elements, trace elements and whole rock Sr-Nd-Pb-Hf isotopes. All the detailed analytical details are given in Huang et al. (2014). Here is a brief description. Whole rock Sr, Nd, Pb and Hf isotope analyses were conducted on a Thermo Finnigan Neptune Plasma Ionisation Multi-collector Mass Spectrometer (PIMMS) instrument in the Northern Centre for Isotopic and Elemental Tracing (NCIET) at Durham University. Sr-Nd-Pb-Hf isotopic analyses were carried out during different analytical sessions for each isotope. The international standards NBS987, J&M, NBS981 and JMC475 were used for Sr, Nd, Pb and Hf isotopes, respectively. The long term performance of the Neptune PIMMS at Durham University for Sr, Nd and Hf isotopes was reported by Nowell et al. (2003). The Sr standard NBS987 yield average $^{87}$Sr/$^{86}$Sr of 0.710277 ± 0.000020 (2SD, n = 39). All data are normalized relative to the accepted standard $^{87}$Sr/$^{86}$Sr ratios for NBS 987 of 0.71024 (Thirlwall, 1991). The average $^{143}$Nd/$^{144}$Nd of J&M is 0.511107 ± 0.000012 (2SD, n = 47). All data are normalized relative to the accepted standard $^{143}$Nd/$^{144}$Nd ratio for J&M of 0.511110 (Thirlwall, 1991). The average of Hf standard JMC475 is 0.282145 ± 0.000008 (2SD, n = 37). Corrections for isobaric interferences from Yb and Lu on $^{176}$Hf were made by monitoring $^{173}$Yb and $^{177}$Lu. All data are normalized relative to the accepted standard $^{176}$Hf/$^{177}$Hf ratio for JMC475 of 0.28216 Nowell et al. (1998). For Pb, mass bias was corrected using $^{205}$Tl/$^{203}$Tl ratios and an exponential law. The best fit ratio for all the Pb ratios was determined for each

Fig. 1. A, Schematic map showing major tectonic units of the Qilian Orogenic Belt (after Song et al., 2013). B, Simplified geological map of the North Qilian Orogenic Belt (NQOB; after Song et al., 2013).
analytical session by minimizing the difference in offset between all Pb ratios and the Galer (1999) values.

Laser ablation ICP-MS zircon U-Pb analysis was carried on an Agilent 7500 ICP-MS instrument equipped with a GeoLas 2005 at China University of Geosciences, Wuhan. Detailed operating conditions for the laser ablation system and ICP-MS instrument and data reduction are the same as described by Liu et al. (2008). Zircon 91500 was used as the external standard and analyzed twice every 5 samples. Standard silicate glass NIST610 was used to optimize the instrument. Common Pb was corrected by ComPtcorr#3.17 (Andersen, 2002). Age calculations and Concordia plots were made using isoplot (Ludwig, 2003). The obtained mean \( ^{206}\text{Pb}/^{238}\text{U} \) ages for 91,500 and GJ-1 are 1062.3 ± 1.3 Ma (2\( \sigma \), n = 202) and 1099.7 ± 1.2 Ma (2\( \sigma \), n = 60), respectively. These results are consistent with the recommended values (Jackson et al., 2004; Wiedenbeck et al., 1995).

4. Results

The minerals in samples from the Jinfosi batholith in this study include Bt, Pl, Kfs and Qtz with Bt varying from 5% to 20%. Some of the samples are peraluminous granites while others are more maﬁc and chemically equivalent to diorites, corresponding to a broad SiO\(_2\) range of 56.8–72.5 wt% with A/CNK 0.9–1.1 (Table S1). The enclosed amphibolite xenoliths (QL10-01) are foliated mafic diorite, containing amphibole (Amp), Bt, Pl and Qtz. Major element data, trace element data and zircon U-Pb dating results are presented as supplements. Whole rock Sr-Nd-Hf-Pb isotopic data of samples from Jinfosi. Age corrected to 420 Ma.

Table 1—Whole-rock Sr-Nd-Hf-Pb isotopic data of samples from Jinfosi. Age corrected to 420 Ma.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>QL10-01</th>
<th>QL10-04</th>
<th>QL10-05</th>
<th>QL10-08</th>
<th>QL10-09</th>
<th>QL10-10</th>
<th>QL10-11</th>
<th>QL10-12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(^{176}\text{Lu}/^{177}\text{Hf})</td>
<td>0.008</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.004</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>0.008</td>
<td>0.021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(^{176}\text{Hf}/^{177}\text{Hf})</td>
<td>0.282921</td>
<td>0.282470</td>
<td>0.282891</td>
<td>0.282841</td>
<td>0.282580</td>
<td>0.282495</td>
<td>0.282686</td>
<td>0.282686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2\sigma)</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(143\text{Nd}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(147\text{Sm}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.512406</td>
<td>0.512310</td>
<td>0.512109</td>
<td>0.512254</td>
<td>0.512250</td>
<td>0.512223</td>
<td>0.512322</td>
<td>0.512232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(176\text{Lu}/^{177}\text{Hf})</td>
<td>12.64</td>
<td>12.78</td>
<td>11.44</td>
<td>11.14</td>
<td>11.19</td>
<td>11.09</td>
<td>11.09</td>
<td>11.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(143\text{Nd}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(147\text{Sm}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.512406</td>
<td>0.512310</td>
<td>0.512109</td>
<td>0.512254</td>
<td>0.512250</td>
<td>0.512223</td>
<td>0.512322</td>
<td>0.512232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(176\text{Lu}/^{177}\text{Hf})</td>
<td>12.64</td>
<td>12.78</td>
<td>11.44</td>
<td>11.14</td>
<td>11.19</td>
<td>11.09</td>
<td>11.09</td>
<td>11.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(143\text{Nd}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(147\text{Sm}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.512406</td>
<td>0.512310</td>
<td>0.512109</td>
<td>0.512254</td>
<td>0.512250</td>
<td>0.512223</td>
<td>0.512322</td>
<td>0.512232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(176\text{Lu}/^{177}\text{Hf})</td>
<td>12.64</td>
<td>12.78</td>
<td>11.44</td>
<td>11.14</td>
<td>11.19</td>
<td>11.09</td>
<td>11.09</td>
<td>11.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(143\text{Nd}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(147\text{Sm}/^{144}\text{Nd})</td>
<td>0.512406</td>
<td>0.512310</td>
<td>0.512109</td>
<td>0.512254</td>
<td>0.512250</td>
<td>0.512223</td>
<td>0.512322</td>
<td>0.512232</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.5 Discussion

4.5.1. Source constraints

Our samples have a large compositional range in SiO\(_2\) (57–72 wt%). The most felsic sample QL10-05 (72% SiO\(_2\)) may share some “S-type” features and others have “andesitic” (or “dioritic”) compositions. Given the peraluminous nature of some samples in this study, sediment effect on Nd-Hf isotopic decoupling should be considered (Chauvel et al., 2008; Patchett et al., 1984). The present-day sedimentary materials generally have elevated \( \varepsilon_{\text{Nd}} \) at a given \( \varepsilon_{\text{Hf}} \) (Chauvel et al., 2008), but this is not adequate to explain the Nd-Hf isotopic decoupling we observe. There are three reasons. (1) Metasedimentary rocks have negative \( \varepsilon_{\text{Hf}} \) values at 420 Ma and more negative if they are more ancient (\( \varepsilon_{\text{Hf}} = 15, \varepsilon_{\text{Nd}} = 10 \), Chauvel et al., 2008), while the most felsic sample QL10-05 with the most decoupled Nd and Hf isotopes have \( \varepsilon_{\text{Hf}}(420) \) of 12.8 and \( \varepsilon_{\text{Nd}}(420) \) of −6.5. (2) Sedimentary rocks have highly radiogenic Sr isotopes (\( \varepsilon_{\text{Sr}} = 0.718 \), Plank and Langmuir, 1998) while QL10-05 has \( \varepsilon_{\text{Sr}} \) of 0.704. (3) Sedimentary rocks are generally heterogeneous, but S-type-like granites with decoupled Nd-Hf isotopes are rarely sampled. Specifically, in the Qilian region, other S-type-like batholiths do not show Nd-Hf isotopic decoupling (Huang et al., 2015; Yang et al., 2016). Compared to the two-mica granites (Yang et al., 2016) and S-type granitoids (Huang et al., 2015) in other Qilian Batholiths, \( \varepsilon_{\text{Nd}} \) values in this study are less radiogenic (0.705 to 0.708 vs. >0.710), \( \varepsilon_{\text{Hf}}(420) \) values are higher (−4 to −2 vs. −12.2 to −3.4) and \( \varepsilon_{\text{Nd}}(420) \) values are much higher (−3.4 to 12.8 vs. −12 to 3.4). Lead isotopes are consistent with the Pb isotopic compositions of the regional crystalline basement (Chen et al., 2007; Zhang et al., 1999). Thus, the...
isotopic data indicate limited contributions from highly enriched upper crust.

It is possible that samples with high SiO2 and depleted HREEs result from elevated accumulation of quartz and feldspars (Wang et al., 2013) or are caused by garnet and amphibole separation at an early evolution stage. However, the decoupling in our samples are initial values, and fractional crystallization cannot produce variations in the initial isotopic signature.

**Fig. 2.** Zircon U-Pb Concordia diagrams to show the age of Jinfosi batholith.

**Fig. 3.** Initial whole rock $\varepsilon_{\text{Nd}}(t)$-$\varepsilon_{\text{Hf}}(t)$ values of Jinfosi samples and modelling results of $\varepsilon_{\text{Nd}}(t)$-$\varepsilon_{\text{Hf}}(t)$ values at 420 Ma for residues produced by melting lower continental crust (LCC) at 2.5 Ga, 2.0 Ga and 1.8 Ga, respectively. The amphibolite xenolith plots off the sample trend. Global terrestrial array (grey field) is from Vervoort et al. (1999). Qilian Block juvenile granitoids are given for reference (Huang et al., 2015). Ticks on each line represent increasing residual garnet percentages from left to right at a given clinopyroxene to plagioclase ratio (Cpx:Pl). Cpx to Pl ratios are assumed to be 1:2, 1:1 and 2:1, after Vervoort and Patchett (1996). Grt proportions are set from 10% to 50%. Hf isotope data for Mohe basement are from Li et al. (2007). Nd isotope data for Mohe basement are from Chen et al. (2007). F: Melt fraction.
The Jinfosi samples display large Nd-Hf isotopic heterogeneity and decoupling. Disequilibrium melting of zircon during crustal anatexis could generate Hf isotope heterogeneity (Tang et al., 2014). But zircon is a minor phase in the crust, and it is difficult to explain the decoupling against the observed general correlation of HREE-depletion with high $\varepsilon_{Hf}(t)$. Garnet, as the most important HREE host phase, has the potential to cause the Nd-Hf isotopic decoupling. To melt the garnet-bearing lower crust, three scenarios are possible. First, if garnet breaks down during crustal anatexis, the derivative melt would have elevated HREEs and $\varepsilon_{Hf}$, which is not mirrored in our study. Second, if garnet does not break down but does not equilibrate with the melt, the derivative melt would have low HREEs and low $\varepsilon_{Hf}$. Third, if garnet does not break down and equilibrates with the melt in the garnet stability field, the derivative melt will have low HREE and elevated $\varepsilon_{Hf}$. Our samples with elevated $\varepsilon_{Hf}$ and depleted HREEs are consistent with the scenario of equilibrium melting with garnet being a residual phase.

The interpretation of these data is complicated by the fact that the variation in initial values can reflect source characteristics, crustal contamination, and magma mixing. However, a common and essential factor in these models is the incorporation of a component that has a substantially decoupled Nd-Hf isotopic composition. It is important to note that the samples with Nd-Hf isotopes that plot furthest away from the terrestrial array are most depleted in the HREEs with higher Dy/Yb values, while samples with Nd-Hf isotopes plotting close to or within the terrestrial array have flat HREEs with lower Dy/Yb values (Fig. 4). This is a simple manifestation of the "garnet effect".

5.2. Modelling

It is possible to model the involvement of garnet in the generation of the strongly decoupled Nd-Hf isotope compositions in the Jinfosi samples. To explore such processes, we use equilibrium melting to illustrate possible Nd and Hf isotope evolution trends as a result of partial melting a lower crust with garnet being a residual phase. If the Jinfosi magma derived from such a source had involved assimilation or mixing processes, then the measured $\varepsilon_{Hf}$ values would be minimal. Hence, our modelling only provides the conservative estimate.

The ages of ~2.5 Ga, 2.0 Ga and 1.8 Ga correspond to important episodes of regional continental crust growth (Grimmer et al., 2003; Tung et al., 2007, 2008). Therefore, the different curves in Fig. 3 represent the loci of isotopic compositions of the residual lower crust with previous melt extraction at 2.5, 2.0 and 1.8 Ga, respectively, calculated at the emplacement age (420 Ma) of the Jinfosi batholith. Re-melting these residua at 420 Ma will pass on the isotope features to the derivative Jinfosi magma. In our calculation, the 2.5 Ga Mohe basement was used as a representative regional lower crust composition (Chen et al., 2007; Li et al., 2007). It is reasonable to use such an old basement because the appearance of the discordant U-Pb age of ~1.4 Ga indicates the inheritance from old lithologies.

To illustrate the concept in detail, a few possible mineral assemblages during crustal anatexis (Rapp and Watson, 1995; Rapp et al., 1991; Vervoort and Patchett, 1996) are examined and only minerals with great potential to cause fractionations between Lu-Hf and Sm-Nd systems are considered. Sources of granitoid magmatism are mostly mafic to intermediate rocks. Therefore, partition coefficients were chosen for a mafic lower crust source. Values are from Vervoort and Patchett (1996) who made the pioneering effort to model the effect of
garnet on Nd-Hf isotopic decoupling in the lower crust environment. The results are summarized in Fig. 3. For the given extent of melting and residual mineral modes, the greatest Nd-Hf isotope decoupling is coupled with older (more ancient) melt extraction/depletion (pink vs. blue, orange curves in Fig. 3). The ingrowth of radiogenic Hf isotopes also increases with increasing residual garnet mode (changes along the curve, Fig. 3), with increasing extent of melting (solid line vs. dashed line in Fig. 3) and with decreasing Cpx/Pl ratio (numerical ratios in Fig. 3). The Cpx/Pl = 1:2 curves slightly bend back to the terrestrial array at garnet modes >30% (Fig. 3) because of the slightly decreasing Lu/Hf ratios resulting from different extents of Lu-Hf growth in the modelling. Re-melting of these ancient melting residues at 420 Ma will produce melts with depleted HREEs and inherited signatures of Nd-Hf isotope decoupling as manifested by the 420 Ma Jinfosi granitic samples. In Fig. 3, the sample with the most decoupled Nd-Hf isotopes at lowest $\varepsilon_{Nd}$ value is close to the 2.0 Ga and 2.5 Ga curve. Its isotopic compositions are consistent with a residue produced by 40% melting at 2.5 Ga with 15% garnet and a 1:2 ratio of Cpx to Pl (Fig. 3). Melt depletion younger than 1.8 Ga or melting degrees lower than 40% (50%, only if depletion occurred after 2.0 Ga) will produce residues with Nd-Hf isotopes that plot within the terrestrial array in Fig. 3. Although the calculation may seem simplistic and limited given the possible complexities involved in crustal melting, it adequately demonstrates that a large extent of melting (~40%) can effectively fractionate Lu-Hf from Sm-Nd system, and that long residence time is required for significant Nd-Hf isotope decoupling. This is because, in addition to the garnet effect, Lu/Hf in the melting residues increases with increasing extent of melting. 40–50% is unusually high and perhaps it points to the unusual thermal conditions during the petrogenesis of the Jinfosi magma because the amphibolite has distinct mineralogy, texture and isotopic compositions (Rbarbarin, 2005; Huang et al., 2014). We interpret the xenolith as being country rock captured during magma emplacement. The presence of this xenolith provides evidence that the Nd-Hf isotopic decoupling may be common in the regional lower crust.

The global database for the lower crust shows that a few samples have super chondritic Lu/Hf ratios that have potential to evolve out of the terrestrial array (Vervoort et al., 2011). These studies suggest the possibilities of finding significantly decoupled Nd-Hf isotopes in granitic magmas derived by melting of the lower crust. However, such granitoids appear to be rare. It is highly likely that the sources from which these granitoids were derived may have had melt depletion too recently to have developed significant Nd-Hf isotope decoupling. Vervoort and Patchett (1996) estimated that hundreds of millions years are required for a garnet-bearing residue to evolve off the terrestrial array. Indeed, our modelling specifically requires that the time-integrated evolution must be longer than 1.4 Gys ($=1.8$ Ga–420 Ma). Additionally, a large extent of melting ($\geq40\%$) is also necessary for significant radiogenic Hf in-growth and thus enhances Nd-Hf isotope decoupling. This is because, in addition to the garnet effect, Lu/Hf in the melting residues increases with increasing extent of melting. 40–50% is unusually high and perhaps it points to the unusual thermal conditions during the petrogenesis of the Jinfosi magma and also accounts for the rarity of such magmas with anomalous Nd-Hf isotopes. Such a large degree of partial melting may be rare; but it is possible that prior to 1.8 Ga larger amounts of partial melting occurred given the greater internal heat at that time (Peacock et al., 1994; Rapp and Watson, 1995; Rapp et al., 1991). For example, 20–40% melting of mafic lower crust can result in granitic melts; 50–60% melting can result in more andesitic/mafic melts (Rapp and Watson, 1995; Rapp et al., 1991). However, residues after such high degrees of partial melting may be too refractory to melt again unless there is an additional heat supply. In the case of the NQOB, this is feasible in the context of post-collisional extension (~420–400 Ma), where basaltic melt derived from upwellings of asthenospheric mantle could have upwelled the crust and caused melting of ancient residual crust. The most straightforward way to explain the jinfosi sample trend is to mix such basalts with mantle array Nd-Hf isotope compositions with melts of lower crust with decoupled Nd-Hf isotopes. This is also supported by the broad negative correlation between $\varepsilon_{Nd}(t)$ and MgO (Fig. 5B) which suggests that samples with higher MgO have lower $\varepsilon_{Nd}(t)$ while samples with lower MgO have higher $\varepsilon_{Nd}(t)$. There are other equally mathematically valid models that can be applied too. For example, it is possible that an andesitic magma with normal Nd-Hf isotopes assimilates the highly isotopically decoupled lower-crust. Alternatively, the Jinfosi sample suite may reflect a series of magmas derived at different pressures involving different amounts of residual garnet, i.e., above the garnet-stability field (flat HREEs) and within the garnet stability field (depleted HREEs). In this case, it requires different degrees of partial melting accordingly to explain the negatively correlated $\varepsilon_{Nd}(t)$-MgO trend (Fig. 5). Nevertheless, in all these situations, a key component with HREE-depletion and decoupled Nd-Hf isotopes (“garnet effect”) is required.

The evidence for occurrence of a garnet effect in the lower crust is limited by the nature of sampling (Schmitz et al., 2004). Extraction of melt within the garnet stability field will lead to garnet-bearing residua that evolve rapidly with time, above the mantle Nd-Hf isotope array. The complementary melts should evolve below the array. Possible examples are tonalite–trondhjemite–granodiorite (TTG) suites, which dominate the preserved Archean crustal masses (Condie, 1981; Hoffmann et al., 2011; Martin et al., 2005). The TTGs were produced by 20–40% melting at depths where garnet was present as a residual phase (Rapp and Watson, 1995; Rapp et al., 1991; Xiong, 2006). The longer crustal residence of TTGs promotes greater evolution and divergence in their isotope compositions. It is thus expected that the ancient TTGs have present-day Nd and Hf isotopes below the terrestrial array. We have compiled the available Nd-Hf isotope data for the TTGs of Archean and Proterozoic age (Fig. 6). Indeed, many of them plot below the terrestrial array as anticipated. Some of the TTGs plot within the array, reflecting the complexities of the TTGs petrogenesis, e.g., some of them may be derived through multiple partial melting events or a lower extent of melting, and/or lower modal garnet in the melting residues as evidenced by the abundant TTGs with flat HREEs.

![Fig. 6. Compilation of present day Nd-Hf isotopic compositions for Archean-Paleoproterozoic TTGs showing that they plot below the terrestrial array due to equilibration with residual garnet, compared to the melting residues with above mantle-array Nd-Hf isotopes. Vectors are estimated according to Fig. 3. Data are from Hoffmann et al. (2011), Shan et al. (2015), Yang et al. (2008). Terrestrial array is from Vervoort et al. (2011).](image-url)
Acknowledgement

The research was supported by Chinese NSFC grants (91014003, 41130314, 41030007) and Chinese Academy of Sciences Innovation (Y422171011). Grants from Shandong Province and City of Qingdao are also appreciated. We thank Prof. Michael Roden and Prof. Shuguang Song for the constructive comments. Thanks are owed to Editor Sun-Lin Chung for editorial help. In addition Prof. Michael Roden, Professor Jean-François Moyen, Prof. Paterno Castillo, and three anonymous reviewers provided insightful comments that helped to improve the early version of this manuscript.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.lithos.2016.12.022.

References

Barbarin, B., 2005. Mafic magmatic enclaves and mafic rocks associated with some granitoids of the central Sierra Nevada batholith, California: nature, origin, and relations with the hosts. Lithos 80, 155–177.